

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO  
WESTERN DIVISION

REBECCA BYBEE, : Case No. C-1-01-623  
: Plaintiff, : Judge Weber  
vs. : Magistrate Judge Hogan  
: THE PROCTER & GAMBLE :  
COMPANY, et al., : Defendants. :  
: :  
: :

---

**DEFENDANT'S MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION  
TO PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO SUPPLEMENT RECORD**

---

Defendants, The Procter & Gamble Company and The Procter & Gamble Health Care Plan ("Defendants"), hereby oppose Plaintiff's attempt to supplement the Administrative Record with the audio recording of a conversation that purportedly occurred between Plaintiff Rebecca Bybee and a person named "Heather" (whom Plaintiff, without any support, alleges was "an employee of The Procter & Gamble Co."). Simply stated, Plaintiff is not permitted to conduct discovery in this case or add information or documents to the Administrative Record. The Court has made it clear, in its rulings, that Plaintiff was entitled to conduct minimal discovery solely "for the limited purpose of determining the contents of the Plan Document." See Orders, Doc. #44 and 51. Plaintiff has already done so. Plaintiff now attempts to do an end-run around clearly established case law regarding the adjudication of ERISA cases and this Court's orders by requesting the Administrative Record be supplemented with a portion of a taped conversation

that has not been sufficiently authenticated. Plaintiff's request to supplement the record should be denied.

Respectfully submitted,



John E. Jevicky, Esq. (0012702)  
Jennifer M. Orr, Esq. (0069594)  
DINSMORE & SHOHL LLP  
1900 Chemed Center  
255 East Fifth Street  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
(513) 977-8200

*Trial Attorneys for Defendants*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

It is hereby certified that the foregoing **Defendants' Memorandum in Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion to Supplement Record** has been forwarded regular U.S. mail, postage prepaid, this 24th day of September, 2004, to the following:

Carl E. Grayson, Esq.  
7801 U.S. 42  
Florence, KY 41042  
(859) 283-9990  
*Trial Attorney for Plaintiff*

